

## City of Durham

At a Meeting of **SCRUTINY COMMITTEE** held in the Town Hall, Durham, on Monday, 10 July 2006 at 5.30 p.m.

**Present:** Councillor Pape (in the Chair)  
and Councillors Crathorne, Cummings, Freeman, Howarth, Moderate, Robinson, Simmons, Simpson and Wolstenholme.

**Also Present:** Councillors: Bell, Cowper, Dickie, Gibbon, Hepplewhite, Lightley, Lodge, Marsden, Pitts, Southwell, Syer, Thomson, Turnbull and Young

### **117. APOLOGIES FOR ABSENCE**

Apologies for absence were received from Councillor Walton

### **118. MINUTES**

Minutes of the Meeting of 6<sup>th</sup> March, 2006, were confirmed as a correct record.

### **119. CHAIRMAN'S REMARKS**

The Chairman introduced the new Scrutiny Handbook, this document had been produced in line with IDeA recommendations, and was brought to the attention of Scrutiny Committee Members, for information.

In due course all Councillors will be issued with a copy of the Handbook.

### **120. FORWARD PLAN**

The Committee considered the Forward Plan, which was effective from 3<sup>rd</sup> July, 2006. Councillor Howarth informed Members that she had received the information she had requested from the Head of Housing Services regarding the Supporting People/Value Improvement Programme.

### **121. DECISIONS TAKEN BY PORTFOLIO HOLDERS SINCE LAST MEETING**

Although not a Members of the Scrutiny Committee, Councillor Bell declared a personal interest in Portfolio Holder Decision No.21.

A copy of the schedule indicating the decisions taken by Portfolio Holders since the last Meeting is attached at Appendix A.

### **122. CABINET DECISIONS 28<sup>th</sup> June 2006**

The Cabinet report had been noted and there were no items on which the Committee wished to comment.

### **123. REPORT OF ECONOMIC SCRUTINY PANEL**

Economic Scrutiny Panel had been tasked with scrutinising the subject of SRB-6. A copy of the report had been circulated to Members.

Members discussed the report and various questions regarding meaning were made. Additionally, some minor amendments were suggested for clarity.

#### **It was agreed:**

- (i) That Recommendation 4.4 be amended to read:  
  
“That Members are content with the governance arrangements between Central Government, One North East, Durham County Council and City of Durham Council.”
- (ii) That recommendation 4.5 be amended to read:  
  
“That awareness is raised about the subjective nature of projects and the difficulty in quantifying success.”
- (iii) That subject to the above mentioned amendments, the report be referred to Cabinet for consideration.

### **124. REPORT OF ENVIRONMENT SCRUTINY PANEL**

Environment Scrutiny Panel had been tasked with scrutinising the subject of Recycling within the City of Durham area. A copy of the report had been circulated to Members.

Members discussed the report and it was felt some minor amendments should be made prior to the report going to Cabinet.

#### **It was agreed:**

- (i) That Recommendation 5 have the following sentence added:  
  
“Notwithstanding, the City of Durham reaffirms it’s commitment to an increased provision of green waste recycling across the district.”
- (ii) That recommendation 10 have the following addition made:  
  
“and that the Panel report back to Cabinet as soon as possible.”
- (iii) That subject to the above mentioned amendments, the report be referred to Cabinet for consideration.

## **125. REPORT OF POLICY SCRUTINY PANEL**

Policy Scrutiny Panel had been tasked with scrutinising the subject of the City of Durham's Telephone Communications System. A copy of the report had been circulated to Members.

Members expressed continuing concern over ongoing problems with the telephone communications and it was noted that an interim progress report would be brought back to the Panel in October 2006.

**It was agreed:** That the report be referred to Cabinet for consideration.

## **126. VERBAL UPDATE ON PROGRESS FROM SCRUTINY PANELS**

The Chairmen of the various Scrutiny Panels gave verbal reports on the progress of their respective Scrutiny topics for the information of Members.

## **127. ANNUAL REPORT**

The Annual Scrutiny report 2005 – 2006 was circulated to Members. The report was agreed for submission to the next meeting of the Council.

## **128. ALLOCATION TOPICS FOR SCRUTINY**

The undermentioned was requested and identified as a suitable future topic for scrutiny.

- Tourism

It was agreed that the topic be allocated to the Economic Scrutiny Panel for consideration.

In addition, the topic of the Riverbanks was thought to be a connected subject that could be looked at by the Environment Panel. This topic would be raised formally in due course.

## **129. ANY OTHER BUSINESS**

Some Members were concerned as to the number of meetings that have been rearranged and also the number of meetings held on any one particular day. The Chairman noted this and expressed his personal commitment to ensure that Scrutiny meetings would not be rearranged unnecessarily, save for exceptional circumstances.

Meeting terminated at 6.15 p.m.

Chairman

**SCRUTINY COMMITTEE**  
**10 July 2006**  
**DECISIONS TAKEN BY PORTFOLIO MEMBERS**

No.	Portfolio Member	Nature of Decision	Date
1	Councillor Rae	Application received for a Durham City Enterprise Grant of £1,000 as follows:- David Platt T/A Consider it Delivered - £500 Stuart Langley T/A SGL Tiling - £500 Recommend approval of the Grant of £1,000	17.5.06
2	Councillor Holland	Application received for a Durham City Enterprise Grant from Jenny Gibson T/A Gibson Secretarial Services - £500 Recommend approval of the Grant of £500	17.5.06
3	Councillor Wynn	Application for financial assistance from the Northern Regional Brass Band Trust to help fund courses to enable them to carry out its programme for the coming year Recommend refusal of the application	08.5.06
4	Councillor Wynn	Application for financial assistance from the PDSA to enable the organisation to provide free veterinary care to sick and injured animals for pet owners within the DH1-6 area. Recommend to offer a donation of £50	08.5.06
5	Councillor Holland	Application received from Mr & Mrs Swinbank of 28 South Lea, Witton Gilbert to purchase land adjacent to their property for use as garden for their children to play. Recommend the application be approved subject to a reduced area being offered via the normal land application procedure	18.5.06
6	Councillor Reynolds	Application received from Mr Lowery of 45 Coppice Hill, Esh Winning to purchase 33 square metres or thereabouts of land to solve drainage problems which affect his driveway and may affect the foundations of his home. Recommend approval of sale of a strip of land not more than 1 metre wide along the entire length of the common boundary with no. 45 and subject to the usual conditions	19.5.06
7	Councillor Holland	Application received from Ms Rogers of 7 Middle Grove, Brandon to purchase land adjacent to her property for use as additional off-street parking. Recommend approval of sale subject to conditions mentioned.	25.5.06
8	Councillor Holland	Application received from Mr Walker of 163 Canterbury Road, Newton Hall for Right of Vehicular access over Council land to the front of his property for manoeuvrability. Recommend that application be refused	26.5.06

9	Councillor Holland	Application to agree to Head of Planning Services to sign an Agreement with BT to carry out further feasibility into rolling out a Micro Distributed Antennae Network within the City Centre Recommend approval of application	29.5.06
10	Councillor Reynolds & Councillor Southwell	Application received in respect of a Home Loss Payment as a result of the Council compulsorily displacing the applicant from his home (Ref. 301). Recommend approval of a payment of £3,400 minus outstanding rent arrears of £261.72	05.06.06
11	Councillor Woods	Authorisation of temporary closure of the following roads to all vehicles except for emergency vehicles on 1 July 2006 between the hours of 10 a.m. and 5.30 p.m. and 2 July 2006 between the hours of 10 a.m. and 5 p.m. for the Summer Festival Market Place, Saddler Street, North & South Bailey, Palace Green, Owengate, Dun Cow Lane, Bow Lane and Silver Street. Recommend that an order be made in accordance with the provisions of Section 21 of the Town Police Clauses Act 1847 authorising the temporary closure	01.06.06
12	Councillor Woods	Authorisation of temporary closure of the following roads to all vehicles including pedal cyclists on 8 July 2006 between the hours of 7.30 a.m. and 5.00 p.m. to enable the Durham Miners' Gala to take place. Framwellgate Bridge, Market Place, Saddler Street, Owengate, North & South Bailey, Dun Cow Lane, Bow Lane, Silver Street, New Elvet Bridge, Elvet Bridge, Old Elvet, Territorial Lane, Elvet Waterside, New Elvet, Court Lane, Elvet Crescent, Church Street, Whinney Hill, Hallgarth Street between its junction with Church Street/New Elvet and Stockton Road roundabout at Mountjoy, Milburngate between North Road and the access road to Framwellgate Waterside, Crossgate from junction with North Road/Framwellgate Bridge to the junction with South Street, North Road (between its junction with Framwellgate Bridge and North Road Roundabout, between the hours of 8.30 a.m. to 10.00 a.m. and 15.00 to 17.00). Recommend that an order be made in accordance with the provisions of Section 21 of the Town Police Clauses Act 1847 authorising the temporary closure	1.06.06
13	Councillor Woods	Authorisation of temporary closure of the following roads on 2 September 2006 between the hours of 12.30 p.m. and 1.00 p.m. to enable a Procession to take place: Saddler Street, Owengate and Palace Green. Roads to be closed to all vehicles including pedal cyclists. Recommend that an order be made in accordance with the provisions of Section 21 of the Town Police Clauses Act 1847 authorising the temporary closure	1.06.06

14	Councillor Southwell	Application received from Mr & Mrs Hudson of 37 Musgrave Gardens, Gilesgate regarding the granting of a further licence from 17 June 2006 of occupy land for the purpose of private domestic garden. Recommend the granting to Mr & Mrs Hudson of an annual garden licence	5.06.06
15	Councillor Reynolds	Application for financial assistance from County Durham Society of the Blind and Partially Sighted of 1 Church Lane, Durham City to help support its talking newspaper which is circulated free of charge to over 700 blind or partially sighted listeners across County Durham Recommend that a donation of £100 be made to the Society	5.06.06
16	Councillor Reynolds	Application received from Mr Abbott of 2 Foster Avenue, Sherburn Village enquiring if the Council would sell him approx. 38 sq. metres or thereabouts of land on which to build a garage Recommend that subject to contract and certain conditions outlined an area of 38 sq. metres or thereabouts be offered to the applicant on terms to be agreed by the Council Valuer	8.06.06
17	Councillor Southwell	Approval given for the adaptation to the home of a Disabled Person at 29 Aldridge Court, Ushaw Moor at a cost of £4,447 for a curved stairlift	1.06.06
18	Councillor Southwell	Approval given for the adaptation to the home of a Disabled Person at 7 Stackgarth, Brandon at a cost of £4,190.72 for alterations to the toilet	1.06.06
19	Councillor Holland	Application received for a Durham City Enterprise Grant of £500 from Kevin Robinson t/a K & N News Recommend approval of Grant of £500	6.06.06
20	Councillor Southwell	Application received from Mr Seed of 21 Halliday Grove, Langley Moor who has been in occupation of a parcel of Council owned land under Licence and this Licence is due to expire on 28 June 2006. Recommend approval to grant Mr Seed an annual Garden Licence to run from year to year	8.06.06
21	Councillor Rae	Application for SRB6 Improving the Heart of the Villages received from New Brancepeth Primary School & Nursery - £6,750 Software Express Distribution - £1,200 Recommend approval of the Grant	9.06.06
22	Councillor Reynolds	Application received to allow free coach parking in the City Centre for the Summer Festival Weekend (1 <sup>st</sup> and 2 <sup>nd</sup> July 2006). Recommend that the application be approved	14.06.06
23	Councillor Rae	Application for a Durham City Enterprise Grant received from Paul Smith t/a Durham Padi Scuba - £500 and Stuart McVeigh t/a S M Sales - £500 Recommend approval of the Grant of £500 each	16.06.06

24	Councillor Rae	Application for a Durham City Enterprise Grant received from Angela Hanson t/a Hands on Beauty - £500 Recommend approval of the Grant	16.06.06
25	Councillor Holland	Application received from Mr Brown of Fold Cottage, Witton Gilbert enquiring whether the Council would consider leasing him land adjacent to his property for use as additional garden. Recommend that the application be approved subject to the usual conditions	16.06.06
26	Councillor Holland	Application received from Chris Smith t/a Chris Smith Personal Training for a Durham City Enterprise Grant of £500 Recommend approval of the Grant	19.06.06
27	Councillor Holland	Application received from Paul Balmont t/a Option C Community Interest Company - £500 Geoffrey Gilpin t/a Exmoor Drystone Walling - £500 Steve Argument t/a Durham District Decoration - £500 Recommend approval that only Steve Argument t/a Durham District Decoration be given grant of £500	19.06.06
28	Councillor Reynolds	Application received to allow free coach parking in the City Centre for the Christmas Festival Weekend (2 & 3 December 2006). Recommend approval of application	13.06.06
29	Councillor Reynolds	Application received from Mrs Flowers of 68 Edge Court enquiring whether the Council would consider leasing to her the land adjacent to her property for garden use only. Mrs Flowers already leases an area adjacent to her property and wishes to lease the remainder. Recommend refusal of the application.	19.06.06
30	Councillor Reynolds	Application received from Mr Brummitt on behalf of his mother, Mrs McDonald, who rents council property at 19 Ramona Avenue, Kelloe to rent land for use as additional garden on which to place a greenhouse. Recommend refusal of application	26.6.06